RACE TO LEAD REVISITED

Webinar Presented by the Building Movement Project
Today’s Agenda

1. Review the Findings
2. Clarifying / Data Questions
3. Discussion with:
   - Margaret Mitchell, President & CEO, YWCA of Greater Cleveland
   - Edgar Villanueva, Senior VP, Schott Foundation and Author, *Decolonizing Wealth*
   - Kerrien Suarez, Executive Director, Equity in the Center
4. Q & A with Panelists
About the Survey

In 2016, the Building Movement Project conducted a survey of nonprofit employees across the country. More than 4,000 people answered questions about their experiences of race and leadership in nonprofit settings.

In 2019, BMP did the survey again. This time more than 5,000 nonprofit staff participated.
Poll 1: Did you fill out the Race to Lead Surveys?

449 Respondents

- Yes, I participated in 2019 and 2016: 15%
- Yes, I participated in 2019 only: 6%
- Yes, I participated in 2016 only: 3%
- No, I didn’t know about the survey(s): 6%
- No, I wasn’t eligible (not a nonprofit employee): 3%
- No, I knew about the survey but didn’t fill it out: 55%
The composition of the 5,261 survey respondents was remarkably similar to the more than 4,000 participants in the original survey from 2016.
Gender and Sexuality

GENDER IDENTITY

- WOMEN*
- MEN*
- GENDER NON-BINARY/GENDER NON-CONFORMING/GENDERQUEER**

SEXUAL ORIENTATION

- LGBTQ+
- STRAIGHT

2016
- 78% WOMEN*
- 19% MEN*
- 3% GENDER NON-BINARY
- 3% GENDER NON-CONFORMING
- 21% LGBTQ+
- 79% STRAIGHT

2019
- 81% WOMEN*
- 16% MEN*
- 3% GENDER NON-BINARY
- 3% GENDER NON-CONFORMING
- 21% LGBTQ+
- 79% STRAIGHT
In a new survey question, 10% of respondents—both people of color and white people—reported having a disability.
The Biggest Change was by Generation

A 2018 analysis from the Pew Research Center notes that Millennials have become the largest share of the U.S. workforce.
Three Key Findings

1. The Findings of the Original Race to Lead Report are Still Relevant Three Years Later
2. There is a White Advantage in the Nonprofit Sector
3. Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Efforts are Widespread, and People are Uncertain about their Effectiveness
1. The Same Story

Similar to the first Race to Lead report, we found that people of color and white respondents were similarly qualified and motivated. The barriers to advancement that people of color faced were due to systemic biases.
Level of Interest in Top-Level Leadership Roles

- **Definitely/Probably Yes**
  - 2016: 50% (People of Color), 40% (White)
  - 2019: 52% (People of Color), 37% (White)

- **Maybe**
  - 2016: 26% (People of Color), 26% (White)
  - 2019: 25% (People of Color), 28% (White)

- **Definitely/Probably No**
  - 2016: 24% (People of Color), 24% (White)
  - 2019: 34% (People of Color), 35% (White)
Impact of Race on Career Advancement

2016
Combined Very/ Slightly Negative for POC: 35% in 2016 and 49% in 2019

2019
Combined Very/ Slightly Positive for White: 50% in 2016 and 67% in 2019

Person of Color: Very Negative Slightly Negative No Impact Slightly Positive Very Positive
White: Very Negative Slightly Negative No Impact Slightly Positive Very Positive
“It is challenging constantly being the only Latina in all-white and mostly male circles. It is a constant challenge of knowing when to be strategic to stand up for my community and when I need to hold back or else be left out of decision-making circles and labeled as the ‘angry Latina.’”

- Latina Survey Respondent
Challenges and Frustrations

- **Demanding workload**: 70% (People of Color) vs. 71% (White) in 2016; 67% (People of Color) vs. 67% (White) in 2019.
- **Inadequate salaries**: 51% (People of Color) vs. 46% (White) in 2016; 47% (People of Color) vs. 38% (White) in 2019.
- **Few opportunities for advancement**: 45% (People of Color) vs. 41% (White) in 2016; 42% (People of Color) vs. 31% (White) in 2019.
- **Lack of role models**: 39% (People of Color) vs. 27% (White) in 2016; 42% (People of Color) vs. 23% (White) in 2019.

Responses: Often or Always

2016

2019
“I've had phenomenal support, mentorship and sponsorship by women of color, mostly Black women like myself, who have provided the emotional support critical to enduring and persisting through microaggressions. I would not have been able to persist [in the nonprofit sector] without them.”

- Black Woman Survey Respondent
Perceptions of the Racial Leadership Gap

- **2016**
  - Executive recruiters don’t do enough to find a diverse pool of qualified candidates for top level nonprofit positions: 80% agree, 67% disagree.
  - Organizations often rule out candidates of color based on the perceived “fit” of the organization: 66% agree, 48% disagree.
  - It is harder for people of color to advance because of their smaller networks: 56% agree, 30% disagree.
  - People of color must have more skills and training than white peers to be considered for top level positions*: 47% agree, 29% disagree.
  - People of color are less likely to want to work in white-dominant organizations: 42% agree, 29% disagree.

- **2019**
  - Executive recruiters don’t do enough to find a diverse pool of qualified candidates for top level nonprofit positions: 82% agree, 66% disagree.
  - Organizations often rule out candidates of color based on the perceived “fit” of the organization: 77% agree, 52% disagree.
  - It is harder for people of color to advance because of their smaller networks: 69% agree, 42% disagree.
  - People of color must have more skills and training than white peers to be considered for top level positions*: 88% agree, 65% disagree.
  - People of color are less likely to want to work in white-dominant organizations: 58% agree, 39% disagree.
Poll 2: How does the racial / ethnic demographics of the people in top leadership roles (staff and board) of the organization where you currently work match or mismatch the demographics of the community you work with?

467 Respondents

- Mostly matches: 38%
- Somewhat matches: 23%
- Somewhat mismatches: 24%
- Mostly mismatches: 15%
2. The White Advantage

The data shows that there is a white advantage in the nonprofit sector in:

1. The racial makeup of people in positions of power in nonprofit organizations;
2. How respondents experience their workplace based on the racial demographics of its leadership
3. Income disparities based on race in both nonprofit organizational budgets and the personal finances of survey respondents.
“I am usually the only or one of a handful of BIPOCs [Black, indigenous, and people of color] in the room. It’s such an isolating, frustrating, and infuriating dynamic ... The lack of leadership of color at every organization I’ve worked at has impacted not only the running of the organization, but my own professional and even personal development.”

- Black Woman Survey Respondent
The Whiteness of Organizations

RACIAL COMPOSITION OF ORGANIZATIONS BY ROLE (2019)

- **Board of Directors**
  - Less than 25% POC: 57%
  - 25%-49% POC: 24%
  - 50%-74% POC: 11%
  - 75%-100% POC: 8%

- **Staff in Top Leadership Roles**
  - Less than 25% POC: 58%
  - 25%-49% POC: 18%
  - 50%-74% POC: 12%
  - 75%-100% POC: 13%

- **Staff Not in Top Leadership Roles**
  - Less than 25% POC: 30%
  - 25%-49% POC: 29%
  - 50%-74% POC: 23%
  - 75%-100% POC: 17%

- **Constituents/Community Served**
  - Less than 25% POC: 15%
  - 25%-49% POC: 21%
  - 50%-74% POC: 30%
  - 75%-100% POC: 34%
# Categorizing Organizations

## Board of Directors and Staff Leadership Racial Composition

**Legend:**
- **White-Run:** Board/Leaders > 75% White
- **All Other Compositions of Board/Leaders**
- **POC-Led:** Board/Leaders > 50% POC

### Racial Composition of Staff in Top Leadership Roles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Racial Composition of Staff in Top Leadership Roles</th>
<th>LESS THAN 25% POC</th>
<th>25-49% POC</th>
<th>50-74% POC</th>
<th>75-100% POC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LESS THAN 25% POC</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-49% POC</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>7%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-74% POC</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75-100% POC</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Overall Racial Composition by Organization Type

- **White-Run:** Board/Leaders > 75% White: 45%
- **All Other Compositions of Board/Leaders**: 41%
- **POC-Led:** Board/Leaders > 50% POC: 14%
# Smaller Gaps in Workplace Experience in POC-Led Orgs

## Workplace Experiences by Racial Composition of Organizational Leadership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization Type</th>
<th>I would be happy if I worked at this organization three years from now</th>
<th>I feel I have a voice in my organization</th>
<th>My organization offers fair and equitable opportunities for advancement and promotion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White-Run: Board and Leaders &gt; 75% White</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Other Compositions of Board/Leaders</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POC-Led: Board and Leaders &gt; 50% POC</td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Bar Chart" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Mean Responses on a scale of 1–10**
“I don’t believe I’m taken as seriously in the workplace because I am a young woman of color. I often question things, which doesn’t always go over well in majority-white organizations. I’ve been used as a ‘token’ brown person.”

- Pakistani Woman Survey Respondent
Money Matters – Organizations

**Organization Budget by Racial Composition of Organizational Leadership**

- **White-run: Board/Leaders > 75% White**
- **All Other Compositions of Board/Leaders**
- **POC-led: Board/Leaders > 50% POC**

### Budget Levels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Budget Level</th>
<th>White-run</th>
<th>All Other Compositions</th>
<th>POC-led</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>$1,000,000 or Less</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>$1,000,001 - $5,000,000</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than $5,000,000</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Money Matters – Individuals

PROMOTIONS, RAISES, AND OTHER INCOME FROM EMPLOYER

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>PEOPLE OF COLOR</th>
<th>WHITE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I received a cost of living raise</td>
<td>41%</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I received a promotion to a position with more responsibility/higher pay</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I received a performance-based raise</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Poll 3: Please select which of the following DEI activities / strategies you think would be most impactful for your organization:

439 Respondents

- Provide training for staff, leadership, and board
- Clarify that DEI is central to organization’s purpose and reflected in mission statement
- Address ways that racial inequity and systemic bias impact issues organization works on
- Increase representation on board/advocacy committees

- 29% of respondents selected the first option.
- 13% selected the second option.
- 12% selected the third option.
- 46% selected the fourth option.
3. DEI Initiatives and Obstacles

The 2019 survey included a range of new questions about respondents’ organizations – particularly related to DEI initiatives.

Overall, the data shows that even though three-quarters of respondents work for organizations with DEI initiatives, the impacts are mixed.
Organization’s Current DEI Strategies

- Provide training for staff, leadership, and board: 58% (People of Color) vs. 69% (White)
- Clarify that DEI is central to organization’s purpose and reflected in mission statement: 63% (People of Color) vs. 65% (White)
- Address ways that racial inequity and systemic bias impact issues organization works on: 62% (People of Color) vs. 63% (White)
- Increase representation on board/advisory committees: 49% (People of Color) vs. 64% (White)
Impact of Race Equity Trainings

Training Topics:
• 68% Understanding terms
• 63% Implicit bias
• 58% Understanding Structural Racism
• 52% White privilege
• 31% Recruiting a diverse staff
• 18% Racial trauma healing
“I have been fortunate that my organization was provided funding for equity training. The trainers helped the group identify ... many of the structural and systemic inequities in our organization’s structure and culture. To have been part of this transformation, it takes love, patience, diplomacy, anger and dogged persistence.”

- Asian Woman Survey Respondent
# DEI Policies and Commitment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ORGANIZATION TYPE</th>
<th>My organization has policies/procedures in place to ensure DEI</th>
<th>Leadership consistently demonstrates a commitment to DEI</th>
<th>My organization takes a public stand on the root causes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White-Run: Board and Leaders &gt; 75% White</td>
<td><img src="chart1.png" alt="Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="chart2.png" alt="Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="chart3.png" alt="Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Other Compositions of Board/Leaders</td>
<td><img src="chart4.png" alt="Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="chart5.png" alt="Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="chart6.png" alt="Chart" /></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POC-Led: Board and Leaders &gt; 50% POC</td>
<td><img src="chart7.png" alt="Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="chart8.png" alt="Chart" /></td>
<td><img src="chart9.png" alt="Chart" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*MEAN RESPONSES ON A SCALE OF 1–10*
Perceptions on Race in the Nonprofit Sector

- **2016**
  - **People of Color:** 84%
  - **White:** 76%
  - **Compliance and Inclusiveness:**
    - We know how to improve diversity, equity, and inclusion in the nonprofit sector but decision makers don't have the will to make changes.
    - One of the big problems in the nonprofit sector is that leadership doesn't represent the racial/ethnic diversity of the U.S.
    - Nonprofits trying to address race/race equity in their organizations often create tensions that they're not equipped to resolve.
    - Issues of race and diversity in the nonprofit sector are so complicated that it's not clear how to resolve them and move forward.

- **2019**
  - **People of Color:** 65%
  - **White:** 50%
  - **Compliance and Inclusiveness:**
    - 72%
    - 49%
    - 89%
    - 80%
    - 31%
    - 27%
“We know the way forward, we can readily identify the barriers – but too often we focus on changing people’s minds about racial inequity, which I sense is beyond anyone’s control. I think we must shift the focus to changing people’s behaviors ... Our country’s history shows [shifting mindsets] is slow and too unpredictable.”

- Black Woman Survey Respondent
## Sectoral Strategies for Change

### Nonprofit Sector Strategies to Increase Leadership Diversity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>All Respondents</th>
<th>EDs/CEOs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White leaders advocate for race equity/against bias</td>
<td>7.9</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership development programs for people of color</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>8.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philanthropy increasing funding to POC-led organizations</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diversifying composition of Board</td>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stronger anti-discrimination laws at state/local/federal level</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mean responses on a scale of 1-10.
Panel Discussion

Margaret Mitchell
President & CEO,
YWCA of Greater Cleveland

Edgar Villanueva
Senior VP, Schott Foundation
and Author, *Decolonizing Wealth*

Kerrien Suarez
Executive Director,
Equity in the Center
Recommendations from *Race to Lead Revisited*

1. Pay attention to the experiences of people of color in the workplace.

2. Ensure that organizational policies reflect the organizational commitment to equity. Act on those policies consistently.

3. Funders need to change their own practices to ensure groups led by people of color get the resources they need to grow and thrive.

4. Set racial equity goals focused on making the organization’s leadership reflect the racial demographics of the population served.

5. Be transparent about DEI progress in organization-wide annual reviews to both guide course corrections and establish ongoing goals.
Share The Findings and Inform Our Research

• Sample social media images and posts at bit.ly/R2LRevisitedPromos

• Interested in the race equity assessment BMP is developing and piloting with organizations? Email info@buildingmovement.org

• Sign up for BMP’s newsletter list at www.buildingmovement.org